PHENOMENOLOGY OF ULAMA AND INDONESIAN POLITICS

Widia Ningsih, Acep Aripudin
Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia,
Email: widianingsih633@gmail.com, acep.aripudin@uinsgd.ac.id

Abstract
The purpose of this study is to analyze the phenomenon of scholars and politics in Indonesia. The data type used in this study is qualitative data, which is categorized into two types: primary and secondary data. This research obtained the results that ulama become people who are in the community but are higher in position than leaders. This important position is because the advice, advice and input of scholars' will always be needed by the leader. This is due to the dynamics of Islamic politics, one of which is the transformation carried out by NU youths who were originally pesantren-based into academics and active on campus, The political movement within NU did initially seem reactive which was influenced by the existence of socio-pyolytic conditions on the one hand and external factors that led to the birth of the change process itself

Keywords: dinamica politik, politic, ulama,

INTRODUCTION

The relationship between Islam and politics in Indonesia is very closely related. In the course of its history, the development of Islam with socio-cultural and political realities at the local level has been involved in politics. In his book Efendi, (1998) said that throughout the development of Indonesia has become an integral part of the political history of this country. Although this does not mean that Islam is inherently a political religion, as some observers have expressed.

Just like Da'wah and politics have a strong connection in Islam as a testament to the process of improving the ummah. There is no doubt that in order to alleviate Muslims from so many complex problems, it is necessary to handle them appropriately and well organized (Muhtadi et al., 2020). The existence of the concept of Modernist Islam in Indonesia gives its own color in the development of Muslims. This thought leads this ummah to the true teachings of Islam which are based on the Qur'an and the Sunnah (Razzaq, 2014).

As a religion that pays attention to every aspect of human life, Islam does not allow its people to behave without clear rules, so that from the beginning Islam has provided guidance and guidance in politics there are four keywords that are of concern to Islam in political affairs, namely leaders; people; rules and benefits. These four keywords are of great concern to the scholars and make them an important theme in each of their works. To get a deeper

understanding of the discourse of siyāsah islamiyyah, it is good to know the thoughts of some salaf scholars regarding politics (Fida, 2014).

The central role of a leader who is a role model in a region such as a country (Malik, 2023). In fact, the theme of leaders, including the traits that leaders should have, the procedure for selecting leaders and the muamalah of leaders to ministers, aides and their people has become a big theme in their books. This is because it is the leader who has the right, authority as well as the obligation to determine and decide every case and problem that befalls the community.

Every time this political performance is held, scholars and religious leaders (including ustad, leaders of religious organizations, speakers, leaders of religious institutions, academics, etc.) are busy becoming the "mouthpiece" or "echo" of politicians and certain candidates or pairs of candidates (paslon). In fact, not a few religious leaders and scholars who participated directly became "paslon" and "cups" (council candidates) competing with figures from other camps. This is the background to the writing of the research, so it feels important to analyze The purpose of this research is to analyze the role of ulama in politics, then how the dynamics of Islamic politics in Indonesia.

RESEARCH METHOD

The research method used in this study is a qualitative descriptive method. The type of data used in this study is qualitative data, which is categorized into two types, namely primary data and secondary data. Data sources are obtained through library research techniques which refer to available sources both online and offline such as: scientific journals, books and news sourced from reliable sources. These sources are gathered based on discussion and linked from one piece of information to another. The data collection technique used in this study is to reduce several studies that have been carried out, then this data is analyzed and then conclusions are drawn.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION
The Role of Ulama in Indonesian Politics

The position and role of ulama' in politics has always been a non-stop discussion both among the ulama' themselves and those who are involved in the political arena. Like other discussions, this issue resulted in two groups; Those who allow ulama' to enter the practical political environment in order to give a good color, and those who think that it is better for ulama' not to get directly involved in politics so that their neutrality can be maintained. Each opinion must have reasons and evidence that they think can be used as an important basis for the opinion.

The scholars who are the basis of this discussion are those who really give up their intention to learn Islamic religious knowledge and spread it among Muslims without any worldly selflessness that they want. 18 Thus, not everyone can be included in the group of scholars, nor is it easy for a person to consider himself a scholar or to be considered a scholar by others.

Such scholars have an important and strategic position in the midst of society. They are a group that is in the middle of society but has a higher position than the leader. This important position is because the advice, suggestions and input of the ulama will always be

needed by the leader. Ibn Qutaybah in his book emphasizes that the ulama' and zuhhād are pivotal actors because they are the advisors of leaders (mulūk) in various matters such as Muḥammad ibn Ka'ab al-Quraẓī who advised 'Umar ibn 'Abd al-'Azīz and al-Awzā'ī who received great respect from al-Manṣūr (Burhanudin, 2012).

Al-Ùurṭushī also recorded interesting stories of conversations between scholars and leaders such as al-Aḥnaf ibn Qays with Mu'awiyyah, Sufyān al-Ùaurī with al-Mahdī and Ibn Sammāk with Hārūn al-Rashīd. All of these stories boil down to the strategic role of the ulama' as advisors to the leader so that they do not deviate in carrying out their obligations to their people. This strategic role is not followed by a high position in the state system, in the sense that it does not have an important official position on the political stage.

The reluctance of the ulama to enter the existing political system is not an indication that they do not engage in politics or consider Islam separate from politics. Se mua ulama' should continue to do politics by not entering the arena of practical politics. This kind of politics maintains the neutrality of the scholars so that every word, speech and deed is only to uphold the truth (sentence al-haqq) wherever and whenever they are. They do not defend party A or B, nor do they support groups and tribes C and D. Nor do they have any personal or group ambitions to approach leaders so that they are known in the wider community. For them, defending the truth is the most important thing regardless of who is defended and what will be gained. In fact, he also conveyed the truth in front of deviant leaders, which is why jihad is especially important for scholars' (afḍal al-jihād kalimat al-haqq tuqālu li imām jā'ir) (Darmawan, 2018)

The institutionalization of Islamic teachings, including in the context of the formation of the national system, is grouped into cultural Islam and structural Islam. Cultural Islam implies that the socialization and institutionalization of Islamic teachings is carried out through efforts that emphasize the change of awareness and behavior of the ummah/society without the involvement of the state and without changing the national system into an Islamic system. Structural Islam, on the other hand, emphasizes these efforts through the establishment of an Islamic national system and public policy. This kind of effort should not be carried out through Islamic political parties, although of course it requires the political will of these public policy makers.

In the cultural Islam movement and political Islam. Cultural Islamic movements are activities of Muslims to fight for their aspirations through non-political activities, such as through mass organizations, da'wah activities, social institutions, etc. Meanwhile, the definition of a political Islamic movement is clear, namely Islamic activities through Islamic political parties, which can be identified through the use of Islamic names, principles, goals or symbols. As in terms of structural Islam, political Islam can live reasonably if it is supported by a political system and climate that provides freedom for the emergence of multi-parties, including religious parties. Although the relationship between the two perspectives is very close and difficult to separate, there are clear differences between the two, especially in terms of the meaning of structural Islam and political Islam; and conversely, people who support political Islam will support structural Islam. However, in reality this is not always the case, which is evidenced both by the political attitude of Islamic figures and the political practices in Indonesia. During the parliamentary democracy, there was no difference between structural Islam and political Islam because Islamic party leaders supported both.

Similarly, in the early days of the New Order, this kind of condition was still the same, but later changed with the Orba government's policy of deideologizing political parties and depoliticizing Islam. In the 1970s and early 1980s, both structural Islam and political Islam received restrictions from the government, resulting in the emergence of cultural Islamic

movements and orientations and rejection of political Islam and structural Islam. On the other hand, even though political Islam in the Orba masses cannot live, there are still many Islamic figures who still have a structural Islamic orientation (Basri, 2017). Of course, this is not expressed through political parties, but through other means, such as Islamic organizations that can also play an interest group. The conditions in this reform era are almost similar to the conditions of the parliamentary democracy era, especially the freedom of expression, the establishment of parties with various streams, etc. This has resulted in the re-emergence of structural Islamic orientation and political Islam simultaneously and without obstacles, although in reality there has also been a change in the orientation of a number of figures who are different from this logic, namely the emergence of an orientation towards political Islam but not automatically supporting structural Islam.

Dynamics of Islamic politics in Indonesia
a. Political dynamics of Nahdatul Ulama and the National Awakening Party

Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) is a religious political organization that cannot be separated from world traditions. Islamic boarding school, which makes the figure of the kiai as a central figure. The charisma of the kiai is enough to color the historical dynamics of NU's political journey, even NU is synonymous with charismatic scholars who are quite influential. In essence, NU is a modern manifestation of the religious life, political and cultural life of the kiai. The NU movement is considered by observers as an organization that represents the traditionalist wing as the antithesis of modernist groups such as Muhammadiyah (Noer, 1987).

In its history, NU stood as a form of reaction from the outside to the purification and renewal movement carried out by the modernist group (Muhammadiyah and Persis). The establishment of this organization is inseparable from the role of kiai with the main community in Islamic boarding schools and rural communities who are the main supporters of this traditional Islamic group. Thus, the nature of NU's existence is an effort to reaffirm the values of religious political traditions that have been institutionalized in a more established network of structures and lifestyles including: Islamic boarding schools, kiai, santri and congregations. They are scattered in the country as units of the political and cultural community of the Islamic community so that NU does not have difficulties in developing its organization. This phenomenon is reflected in the influence of Hadratus Sheikh KH. Hasyim Asyari' in all Islamic boarding schools throughout Java through a stronger scientific geneological network, so that when NU was first politicized, it received support and sympathy from the kiai and the pesantren community in general and its contribution in building scientific traditions through the kiai-pesantren base (Tanthowi, 2021).

The scientific tradition embraced by NU relies on the doctrine of Aswaja which is based on three core role models: First, monotheism by following the understanding of Asyari and Maturidi. Second, in the field of fiqh, follow one of the four imams of the mashab. Third, in the field of Sufism (tarekat) following the way of Junaid al-Baghdadi and Imam al-Ghazali. This is the foundation of NU's Sunniness in developing a complete religious scientific tradition (Wahid, 1985)

The core of the scientific tradition embraced by NU is the organic link between monotheism, fiqh and Sufism in a continuous manner, which in the long term fosters a view of the link between the worldly and ukhrawi dimensions in life. In addition to maintaining the continuity of NU's scientific tradition, another aspect that is quite

prominent is the development of bases rooted in pesantren and tarekat. The real basis of NU is Islamic boarding schools and kiai.

However, Martin Van Bruinessen is worried that if in one hut there is no one who can be expected to be his successor, then in a certain period of time this will be the cause of the collapse of the ideology of the pesantren which is based on the charisma of the lineage (Van Bruinessen, 1994)

NU then took part concretely after being involved in the life of the nation and state, especially in the fields of religious politics, cultural politics and politics. For this reason, NU's claim as a traditional organization began to change, even experiencing a drastic shift. Nakamura stated that NU's claim as a traditional organization in its development is no longer synonymous with conservatism, the sarongs that bring to the table, decadence and ice, its followers are no longer considered as an obstacle to progress (Fealy & Barton, 1996).

This phenomenon began to appear since the early 1980s, especially in the era of KH's leadership. Abdurrahman Wahid for fifteen years led NU as the general chairman of PBNU. He was quite successful in laying the foundations of progressive, modern and inclusive thinking. However, the traditional pattern and color are still maintained based on the rule: " *Al-Mukhafazatuh alal Qadimis Shalih wa Akhzu Aslahah*". Taking new and better values and maintaining old values that are still relevant.

Another interesting phenomenon is NU's direct involvement in empowering Civil Society through NU's political and cultural movements. Observing the phenomenon of NU's work on this cultural path, the role and work of NU youth cannot be doubted. Some of the young NU figures exist in the cultural path and choose to develop political thoughts and movements, such as the empowerment of street children (Fealy & Barton, 1996).

The political transformation that colors the dynamics of NU's journey is focused on the sociological or socio-hostoric aspects that accompany the political dynamics of NU, both internal (NU organization) and external (state). To highlight the journey of NU's political history as a whole, totality and universality. This phenomenon is interesting because NU for a long period of time between generations that have different characters and typologies in coloring NU, they exist to carry out political movements in all fields in the midst of political changes.

This discussion tries to examine the process of religious political transformation that colors the dynamics of NU's political journey. In addition to the paradigm shift in the NU religious political movement as a discourse of reconstruction of traditionalist discourse into radical traditionalism, it has even penetrated into post-traditionalist discourse.

The face of NU has recently changed according to the process it has gone through along with the political conditions that color the dynamics of NU, both internally and externally. The reconstruction of NU's traditionalist discourse can be seen in the discourse developed by the last generation, and now it has penetrated the discourse of liberalism even towards the post-liberalist which displays the new face of NU displayed by NU youth who exist on the cultural path.

Tracking the history of politics and the transformation process, the basis of political movements and thoughts in NU about the empowerment of civil society after Khittah 1926, the following are stated several reasons including: First, Nahdlatul Ulama which since its establishment has been a religious political organization that makes kiai figures the main supporter based on Islamic boarding schools (kiai-santri). Throughout its history, NU has undergone a transformation process that has colored the dynamics of its journey, where NU since its inception has been claimed to be a traditionalist group, now penetrating

into a more open life scene in addition to the birth of NU scholars who have been exposed to the discourse of modernity and the academic community. This is a new phenomenon in this religious organization.

Second, NU, which has made the kiai as a central figure, has also undergone many changes or shifts, besides because the kiai itself is starting to be open to new values. In fact, it has been in intensive contact with politics including practical politics, this phenomenon was seen for example when NU became a political party in the 1950s and later in the reform era, NU frontmen such as KH. Abdurrahman Wahid was elected as the fourth president, KH. Kholil Bisri became the Deputy Chairman of the People's Consultative Assembly (MPR) and several kiai who were active in PKB and other NU-based parties led several kiai to become legislative members. Even so, most NU scholars still choose to take full part by fostering their respective Islamic boarding schools. Third, progressive steps and political actions or movements of NU youth that exist in cultural channels are an interesting phenomenon, especially in building civil society empowerment projects. The work of NU youth in this cultural path is part of the transformation process which shows that NU now and in the future is increasingly existing by adopting developments that occur in various aspects. The NU youth group is also basically divided into two, namely a group that takes part in the national political stage such as Muhaimin Iskandar, Efendi Choiri, Masykur Musa, Khofifah Indar Parawansa and others. The second group is those who exist in the cultural path such as Ulil Abhsar Abdalla, Ahmad Baso, Rumadi, Zuhairi Misrawi etc., they choose to take part in the cultural path by developing critical reasoning of religious thought discourse and political movements towards the empowerment of Civil Society.

In each of these periods, it indicates that NU has undergone a transformation process from the dominance of kiai to the period of undergraduate (intellectual) and recently young people have taken a role whose contribution is quite calculated. A process that shows the dynamics and creative process of each generation in responding to various contemporary developments, for example through the Bahtsul Masail institution. This ulama-based institution intensively discusses political issues (fiqh siyasah) in thematic religious issues (diniyah maudhuiyah) including state issues, democratization, democracy, demonstrations, human rights and mutual funds. These issues are usually discussed in the munas or congresses that discuss daily religious issues (diniyah waqiiyah) such as Friday prayers for the second generation, nikah mut'ah, marriage under hands and minors, land rights, insulin, cloning, demonstrations and demonstrations. This indicates how progressive NU scholars are in responding to various political problems in society. Then the work of intellectuals succeeded in raising the face of NU in the national and international stage as played by KH. Abdurrahman Wahid and KH. Hasyim Muzadi. Another role that is quite taken into account is the existence of NU youth in the cultural path with an obsession with empowering civil society in the form of defending labor rights and poor farmers in remote villages. In the national political arena, NU's ability to take a role with the state (NU Vis a Vis Negara). In certain conditions, NU is very flexible and accommodating to the government (state), but in other conditions NU becomes an opposition to the political policies of the government (state) (Feillard, 1999).

In this case, foreign observers and academics are a special attraction to be studied according to their respective disciplines, both sociologists and religious political observers and foreign observers such as Nakamura, Andree Fillard, Greg Barton Martin Van Bruinessen, Sidney Jones and others. While in the last decade there has been a shift in the political movement of NU's religious religion, it continues to show that the nuances of

dynamics are phenomena that need to be observed academically, for example, the struggle of groups of politicians and intellectuals-academics as well as those who are active in cultural movements or cultural movements, respectively, take part in the political and political context in the country.

The various dynamics that color NU's journey are interesting to read, especially on NU's readiness to accept new values while maintaining old values that are still relevant. In this frame of mind, the author then assumes that this phenomenon is a process of political transformation in a more global sense, namely the transformation of religious, political, and cultural politics. This is also what has colored the cultural and transformative political movement of NU throughout history. Then review the process of political transformation in the thinking of the NU people which colors the dynamics of NU's political journey in the midst of the current of political change by fostering an attitude of openness to the values of modernity in every dimension of life, including in the scene of political, cultural, religious, national and state life, as well as those who are active in cultural movements or cultural movements respectively taking part in the political and political context in the country.

The various dynamics that color NU's journey are interesting to read, especially on NU's readiness to accept new values while maintaining old values that are still relevant. In this frame of mind, the author then assumes that this phenomenon is a process of political transformation in a more global sense, namely the transformation of religious, political, and cultural politics. This is also what has colored the cultural and transformative political movement of NU throughout history. Then review the process of political transformation in the thinking of the NU people which colors the dynamics of NU's political journey in the midst of the current of political change by fostering an attitude of openness to the values of modernity in every dimension of life, including in the scene of political, cultural, religious, national and state life.

Political movements in NU do seem to be reactive at first, which is influenced by socio-peolitic conditions on the one hand and external factors that lead to the birth of the change process. Therefore, the author sees the context of the movement that is the object of study in this research on the NU political movement that the transformation occurs in several forms including; first, the growth of the collective awareness of NU youth after coming into contact with the scope of real life in society, in addition to the influence of nuances and academic aura for those who continue their post-pesantren education. The periodization that marked this transformation was identified since the early 1980s, precisely after NU returned to Khittah 1926 and this phenomenon continues until now. However, looking at the time interval that accompanied the transformation process of the political movement of NU youth was the birth of young NU intellectuals spearheaded by the presence of KH. Abdurrahman Wahid (Gus Dur) who is also a locomotive of NU intellectualism who has just returned from studying in the Middle East.

Second, the transformation of a political and cultural movement that is the main base of the NU youth movement into a transformative movement at the level of the young generation, especially those who are active on campus. The base of their movement was built through the study and political institutions that later established LKiS in Yogyakarta, Pyramid Circle, Lakpesdam, P3M each in Jakarta and several NU youth organizations that were geneologically rooted in the NU "ideology". Their activities are quite diverse, ranging from the level of carrying out discourse, including in building a liberal Islamic Network (JIL) which is quite phenomenal, to penetrating into political movements such as the empowerment of Civil Society. Of course, the transformation process indicates a paradigm

shift in the NU religious political movement. Remembering that it does not only happen to profane things, but also touches on the sacred aspects of a movement. Simply put, the transformation process that occurred began with a transformative vision of religion that served as the spirit and source of the Movement's values.

b. Imperial Style Trends

Indonesia consists of various types of tribes, udaya and forms of government, even in some areas the royal system is still used. This is because in the 13th century, Islamic kingdoms emerged and ruled until the beginning of the 20th century. The transition from a monarchical society to a democratic society is a difficult challenge for Indonesia because it requires a change in mindset from traditional culture to a modern lifestyle.

The reluctance of the Indonesian people to accept the secular state shows the important role of religion in politics. Muslims, who make up about 87% of Indonesia's population, are the biggest supporters of the sustainability of religion's role in politics. With the increase in religious observance in Indonesia in the past decade, the emphasis on the role of religion in politics and government has become stronger (Jati, 2012).

Some Muslims still view their leaders as people who have the authority from God to rule them. Muslims are required to swear allegiance in accordance with the concept of bay'ah put forward by Muslim political scholars.

The concept of bay'ah is less in line with the modern secular model of the state because an oath can only be revoked if a ruler resigns or dies – not by a transfer of power through elections. Some Indonesian Muslims also still believe that in politics, blood relations are an important determining factor in leadership. Muslim preachers often describe ideal leaders through parables, such as Ratu Adil (a just ruler in Javanese folklore) or Khulafa' Rasyidun (the first four rulers in Islamic civilization) (Abdillah, 2015).

Among the leadership qualities that are usually highlighted by this narrative are: absolute justice, lasting government, flawless personality, religiosity, and facing little resistance or enjoying easy domination over enemies. A person who possesses these qualities is then seen as a good leader. Since Indonesian society still views leaders in terms of historical empires, the descendants of a leader are assumed to inherit these qualities.

One example comes from Ustadz Adi Hidayat, a well-known preacher affiliated with Muhammadiyah, the second largest Muslim organization in Indonesia. He listed five key traits for a ruler. Three of them will not succeed in a republican system, but they are perfectly suited to a pious king, i.e. strong faith, perfect morality, and divine guidance.

Another example is Gus Baha from Nahdhiyyin (affiliated with Nahdhatul Ulama, the largest Muslim organization in Indonesia), who often tells the stories of the ideals of rulers in the past, one of which is the Prophet Sulaiman. He succeeded his father as king and was not democratically elected.

Islamic political thinkers generally emphasize the importance of Islamic religious values in animating the government system. They do not separate religion from the state as Western (secular) thinkers view.

CONCLUSSION

This research obtained the conclusion that the phenomenon of ulama participating in this political performance is motivated by how Islam views politics because Ulama' has an important and strategic position in the midst of society. They are a group that is in the middle of society but has a higher position than the leader. This important position is because the advice, suggestions and input of the ulama will always be needed by the leader. As well as the

institutionalization of structural Islamic teachings emphasizes these efforts through the establishment of a national system and Islamic public policies. The current political dynamics of Islamic Indonesia is that Muslims still view their leaders as people who get authority from God to rule them. Muslims are required to swear allegiance in accordance with the concept of bay'ah put forward by Muslim political scholars. The transformation of a political and cultural movement that is the main base of the NU youth movement into a transformative movement at the level of the young generation, especially those who are active on campus, the political movement in NU does initially seem to be reactive which is influenced by socio-peolitic conditions on the one hand and external factors that lead to the birth of the change process itself.

BIBLIOGRAFI

Abdillah, Masykuri. (2015). Islam & dinamika sosial politik di Indonesia. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

Basri, Muhammad. (2017). Ilmu Dan Kekuasaan: Ulama Dan Poros-Poros Politik. Tazkiya.

Burhanudin, Jajat. (2012). Ulama dan kekuasaan: Pergumulan elite politik muslim dalam sejarah Indonesia. NouraBooks.

Darmawan, Candra. (2018). Eksistensi Ulama dalam Pergulatan Dakwah dan Politik di Indonesia: Studi Fenomenologi dalam Isu Syara. Jurnal Managemen Dakwah, 4(2), 133–147.

Efendi, Bahtiar. (1998). Islam Dan Negara Dalam Hukum Internasional. RajaGrafindo Persada. Jakarta.

Fealy, Greg, & Barton, Greg. (1996). Nahdlatul Ulama, traditional Islam and modernity in Indonesia. Monash University Press.

Feillard, Andree. (1999). NU vis a vis Negara; Pencarian Isi, Bentuk dan Makna. Lkis Pelangi Aksara.

Fida, Imanuddin Abil. (2014). Ulama dan Politik: Mengurai Peran Ulama dalam Politik Era Modern. Mahasiswa Megister Fiqh Ushul Fiqh IIUM.

Jati, Wasisto Raharjo. (2012). Ulama Dan Pesantren Dalam Dinamika Politik Dan Kultur Nahdlatul Ulama. ULUL ALBAB Jurnal Studi Islam, 13(1), 95–111.

Malik, Muhammad Ibnu. (2023). Peran Kiai Sebagai Tokoh Sentral dalam Masyarakat Desa Tieng Kejajar Wonosobo. QuranicEdu: Journal of Islamic Education, 2(2), 211–225.

Muhtadi, Asep Saeful, Gumelar, Setia, Haeruddin, Dingding, Ampera, Taufik, Sumarni, Nani, Ma'mun, Titin Nurhayati, Aripudin, Acep, Syafei, Agus Ahmad, Fakhruroji, Moch, & Muhtadin, Teddi. (2020). Pedoman pengembangan seni budaya keagamaan nusantara.

Noer, Deliar. (1987). Partai Islam di Pentas Politik Nasional. Jakarta, Grafiti Pers.

Razzaq, Abdur. (2014). Dinamika Dakwah dan Politik Dalam Pemikiran Islam Modernis di Indonesia. Wardah, 15(1), 7–15.

Tanthowi, Ahmad. (2021). Tradisi Pesantren; Studi Tentang Pandangan Hidup Kiai Di Jawa Sebuah Refleksi Atas Karya Zamakhsyari Dhofir. Didaktika Islamika: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Islam Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Tarbiyah Muhammadiyah Kendal, 12(1), 17–32.

Van Bruinessen, Martin. (1994). NU; Tradisi, Relasi-Relasi Kuasa, Pencarian Wacana Baru. Lkis Pelangi Aksara.

Wahid, Abdurrahman. (1985). Islam, Negara, Dan Pancasila.". Mengurai Hubungan Agama Dan Negara, 91–95.

Widia Ningsih, Acep Aripudin